

*Maria Silvia Grisenti (1) silvia.grisenti@ssica.it, Maria Angela Frustoli (1), Davide Garofali(1), Massimo Cigarini(1), Silvana Barbuti(1) (1)S.S.I.C.A.*

**Abstract**—The aim of this study was to evaluate the behaviour and the possible growth of *L. monocytogenes* in sliced PA-packed salami to provide quantitative data on the fate of *Listeria* in salami with pH and aw values which are usual in that kind of products during shelf-life. For the study, 4 types of salami having different production characteristics were used. The results showed that *L. monocytogenes* can not grow in matured salami with water activity values from 0.92 to 0.95 and pH values from 5.1 to 5.7. Inhibition was recorded both at refrigeration temperatures (4 and 8° C) and under temperature abuse conditions (15, 21 and 25°C).

M. S. Grisenti is with Stazione Sperimentale Industria Conserve Alimentari, 43121 Parma ITALY (corresponding author to provide phone: + 39-0521 795 268; fax: +39 0521 795218; e-mail: silvia.grisenti@ssica.it). M. A. Frustoli is with Stazione Sperimentale Industria Conserve Alimentari, Parma ITALY (e-mail: angela.frustoli@ssica.it). M. Cigarini is with Stazione Sperimentale Industria Conserve Alimentari, Parma ITALY (e-mail: massimo\_cigarini@libero.it) S. Barbuti is with Stazione Sperimentale Industria Conserve Alimentari, Parma ITALY (e-mail: silvana.barbuti@ssica.it).

**Index Terms**— *Listeria monocytogenes*, Salami, shelf-life

## I. INTRODUCTION

THE European Regulation, n. 2073/2005 come into force in January 2006 and focusing on the microbiological criteria to be applied to food products, approaches the *Listeria* issue in a new way, indicating tolerance criteria for ready-to-eat products [10]. The core of that approach is the consideration that the presence of the pathogen in some categories of foods intended for being consumed without any further listericide treatment (the RTE class), is in contrast with the relatively low incidence of the recorded cases of listeriosis. Risk assessment studies have indicated that low levels of *L. monocytogenes* in food products correspond to a low risk for the consumer's health [5, 11]. The applicability of tolerance criteria for *L. monocytogenes* in RTE food products is defined according to a distinction based on physico-chemical parameters between products in which

*Listeria* growth is possible and those where it is not. Products with  $\text{pH} \leq 4.4$  or  $a_w \leq 0.92$ , products with  $\text{pH} \leq 5.0$  and  $a_w \leq 0.94$ , products with a shelf-life lower than 5 days are automatically included in the second group and therefore the presence of *L. monocytogenes* in those products will be allowed at levels  $\leq 100$  cfu/g. According to those indications, some types of Italian salami would be excluded from the category of products where that tolerance exists, provided that, to the satisfaction of the competent authority, during the shelf-life the established limit is not overcome [2]. The aim of this study was to evaluate the behaviour and the possibility of growth of *L. monocytogenes* in Protective Atmosphere (PA) packed sliced salami during shelf-life.

## II. MATERIALS AND METHODS

The selection of the products on which the Microbial Challenge Test (MCT) should be performed was made according to a criterion of variety of the physico-chemical parameters so as to be able to identify products that were as representative as possible of the types present on the market (Table 1).

A. Physico – chemical analyses pH: measured by probe insertion into the finely minced sample (pHmeter WTW mod. pH330i, equipped with Double pore electrode, Hamilton, CH). Water activity: AquaLab® (Model Series 3TE, Decagon Devices, Inc.).

B. Experimental design of the Microbial Challenge Test (MCT) for *Listeria monocytogenes* MCT was designed and performed according to the guidelines developed by Scott et al. [12] and approved by FSIS/USDA in 2006 [3]. For each of the four types of salami investigated the same procedure was applied. The product was sliced with a bench slicer and placed into PP/EVOH/PP trays (9.5 cm x 14.5 cm x 1.8 cm) (25 g each). For the inoculation a cocktail of five strains of *L. monocytogenes* (L.m. Scott A and L.m. ATCC 7644, L.m. 313, L.m. 223 and L.m. 221, SSICA collection) was used. Inoculum suspension was confirmed, cultured, prepared and

stored as described in a previous work [6]. Packing was performed by using a semi-automated packing machine Food Basic V/G (I.L.P.R.A.) replaced, on sealing the trays, the headspace atmosphere by a PA consisting of 30% CO<sub>2</sub> and 70% N<sub>2</sub>. For tray sealing a transparent film made of PET/PP/EVOH/PP (PET = polyethyleneterephthalate) was used.

C. Microbiological analyses  
Microbiological analyses were performed at 0, 30, 60 e 90 days for each storage temperature. At pre-established times 3 to 5 packs were sampled for each incubation temperature (4, 8, 15, 21 and 25 °C) and *Listeria* counting was performed on the entire content of the pack. Samples of whole and pre-sliced salami were analysed for: Aerobic Plate Count (APC), Enterobacteriaceae, Lactic acid bacteria, *Micrococcus* and *Staphylococcus*, *Brochothrix thermosphacta*, *Staphylococcus aureus*, *Listeria monocytogenes* [6].

D. Analysis of results  
The results were transferred into a log scale for normalization of distribution. The means were compared by analysis of variance with one grading criterion to evaluate whether statistically significant differences were present or not. In *Listeria* quantitative analysis, in case a result is lower than the analytical detection limit (< 3 cfu/g), data processing was performed by considering half threshold value (1.5 cfu/g equivalent to 0.18 log cfu/g and 1.57 log cfu/package).

### III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The physico-chemical and microbiological characteristics of the salami under investigation are reported in Table 2. The data confirm that the four types of salami don't belong to the food category "substrate unable to support the growth of *L. monocytogenes* " and therefore appropriate for setting up the MCT.

Microbiological profiles found are closely related to the typical microbiota of "Italian salami", i.e. a high microbial load, higher than 10<sup>8</sup> cfu/g, consisting of lactic acid bacteria followed by the staphylococci and micrococci group, at levels ranging from 10<sup>5</sup> and 10<sup>7</sup> cfu/g, depending on the type of salami analysed [1, 4]. The results of the four MCTs, one for each type of salami, are shown in Table 3. *Listeria* inocula were 39, 110, 118 and 1300 cfu/g, respectively. From a first evaluation it comes out

that no increase in the initial *Listeria* values was ever recorded in any combinations among types of salami, time and temperature. The observation of average data and relative standard deviations shows a steady reduction in the initial contamination level at all temperatures with a more marked inactivation at 21 e 25°C (temperature abuse). In type 1 salami, which was contaminated with less than 100 cfu/g of *Listeria* to reproduce an authentic level of post-processing contamination, the analytical detection limit was already achieved after 30 days of storage at 21 and 25°C. At 4, 8 and 15°C that limit is attained on day 90.

In MCTs performed in salami types 2 and 3 an initial contamination of around 100 cfu/g was selected to assess the limit set by the Regulation; in that case too, no growth was recorded. On the contrary, the minimum detection limit was achieved after 30 and 60 days of incubation at 25 and 21°C, respectively. In type 4 salami the high inoculation level allowed obtaining a count which was less affected by the detection limit and therefore a better observation at high temperatures of the reduction kinetics for *Listeria* population.

The pathogen behaviour was similar to that observed in the other MCTs. Counting data show *Listeria* inactivation at all temperatures, particularly at the highest ones. On day 90, qualitative analysis, carried out to determine the presence/absence of *Listeria* in 25 g, indicated absence in three out of three samples stored at 21 e 25°C; analysis on samples at 15°C revealed its presence in one out of the three samples analysed. The results obtained in the various types of salami confirmed the marked inactivation occurring during storage at temperatures higher than 15° C, according to what already found by other authors, in aged meat products [6 - 9].

### IV. CONCLUSION

Matured salami is a complex ecosystem where the interaction between the different "hurdles", more or less known, determines the inhibition of *Listeria* growth. The results reported in this study showed that there exists no possibility of *Listeria* growing in matured salami with values of *aw* from 0.92 to 0.95 and pH from 5.1 to 5.7 which, according to predictive microbiology, should instead favour the growth. Inhibition was recorded both at refrigeration temperatures (4 and 8° C) and under temperature abuse conditions (15, 21 and 25°C). A

comparison made between the results obtained by applying predictive models and the actual ones obtained by the Microbial Challenge Testing carried out on four different types of salami, showed that the prediction model was unable to correctly describe the behaviour of *Listeria* in such a complex matrix as salami.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The authors thank Mrs. Gloria Attolini and Mr. Turno Pedrelli for contributing their time, talent and opinion to this work.

## REFERENCES

- [1] Aquilanti, L., Santarelli, S., Silvestri, G., Osimani, A., Petruzzelli, A., & Clementi, F. (2007). The microbial ecology of a typical Italian salami during its natural fermentation. *International Journal of Food Microbiology*.120, 136 -145.
- [2] Commission of the European Communities, Guidance Document on *Listeria monocytogenes* shelf-life studies for ready-to-eat foods, under Regulation (EC) No2073/2005 of 15 November 2005 on microbiological criteria for foodstuffs, Brussels 2008 SANCO/1628/2008 ver.9.3(26112008).
- [3] Compliance Guidelines to control *Listeria monocytogenes* in post-lethality exposed ready-to-eat meat and poultry meat. ([http://www.fsis.usda.gov/OPPDE/rdad/FRPubs/97-013F/Lm\\_Rule\\_Compliance\\_Guidelines\\_May\\_2006.pdf](http://www.fsis.usda.gov/OPPDE/rdad/FRPubs/97-013F/Lm_Rule_Compliance_Guidelines_May_2006.pdf)).
- [4] Dellapina, G., Blanco, D., Pancini, E., Barbuti, S., & Campanini, M. (1994). Andamento microbiologico nella produzione di salami italiani tipo Felino, Milano, Ungherese. *Industria Conserve* 69, 85-90.
- [5] Food and Drug Administration, Food Safety and Inspection Service (FDA-FSIS, February 2003), Draft FSIS Risk Assessment for *Listeria* in Ready-to-eat Meat and Poultry Products.
- [6] Frustoli, M. A., Cigarini, M., Garritani, A, Garulli, S., Bovis, N., Schivazappa, C., & Barbuti, S. (2007). Andamento di *Listeria monocytogenes* durante la shelf-life di bresaola preaffettata e confezionata in atmosfera protettiva. *Industria Conserve* , 82, 325-331.
- [7] Grisenti, M. S., Cigarini, M., Pedrelli, T., Frustoli, M. A., & Barbuti, S. (2008). Microbiologia e sicurezza sanitaria di pancetta stagionata. *Industria Conserve* 83, 13-22.
- [8] Grisenti, M. S., Lori, D., Vicini, L., Bovis, N., Pedrelli, T., & Barbuti, S. (2004). Comportamento di *Listeria monocytogenes* in prosciutto crudo stagionato in rapporto all'atmosfera di confezionamento e alla temperatura di conservazione. *Industria Conserve* 79, 3-12.
- [9] Lindqvist, R., & Lindblad, M. (2009). Inactivation of *Escherichia coli*, *Listeria monocytogenes* and *Yersinia*

enterocolitica in fermented sausages during maturation/storage. *International Journal of Food Microbiology* 129, 59 – 67.

- [10] Regolamento (CE) n. 2073/2005. ([http://europa.eu.int/eurex/lex/LexUriServ/site/it/oj/2005/l\\_338/l\\_33820051222it00010026.pdf](http://europa.eu.int/eurex/lex/LexUriServ/site/it/oj/2005/l_338/l_33820051222it00010026.pdf)).
- [11] Ross, T., Todd, E., & Smith, M. (2000). Exposure Assessment of *Listeria monocytogenes* in ready-to-eat foods: Preliminary Report for Joint FAO/WHO Expert consultation on Risk Assessment of Microbiological Hazards in foods, Rome, Food and Agriculture Organisation of the United Nation Report nr MRA 00/02, 242.
- [12] Scott, V.N., Swanson, K. M.J., Freier, T.A., Payton Pruett W. Jr., Sveum, W.H., Hall, P.A., Smoot, L.A., & Brown, D.G. (2005). Guidelines for Conducting *Listeria monocytogenes* Challenge Testing of Foods. *Food Protection Trends*, 25 (11) 818-825.

Table 1  
Types and characteristics of the salami under investigation

Characteristics	Types of Salami			
	1	2	3	4
Casing	Cloth	Cloth	Collagenic	Natural
Diameter	15*	10	10	6
Granulometry	8	8	3.5	7
Fat %	20	20	32 - 34	28 - 30
Average weight of the product	5	3	3	1

\* ovoidal

Table 2  
Microbiological (log cfu/g) and physico-chemical characterization of salami

Tests	Types of Salami			
	1	2	3	4
Aerobic plate count	8.67	8.30	8.52	8.99
Lactic acid bacteria	8.63	8.30	8.23	8.96
<i>Micrococcus and Staphylococcus</i>	7.30	7.51	5.91	6.73
Enterobacteriaceae	1.76	2.60	1.08	2.45
<i>Brochothrix thermosphacta</i>	3.38	1.72	1.95	1.48
<i>Staphylococcus aureus</i>	0.48	2.49	1.93	2.41
Water activity	0.945	0.943	0.945	0.925
pH	5.2	5.1	5.3	5.7

Table 3  
Fate of *L. monocytogenes* during shelf-life - log cfu/package  $\pm$  St. dev.- average of three determinations

Temperature °C	Days	Types of Salami			
		1	2	3	4
	0 (4 hours)	2.99 $\pm$ 0.00	3.44 $\pm$ 0.10	3.47 $\pm$ 0.31	4.5 $\pm$ 0.12
4	30	2.14 $\pm$ 0.37	3.36 $\pm$ 0.15	3.21 $\pm$ 0.11	3.99 $\pm$ 0.1
	60	1.75 $\pm$ 0.27	2.75 $\pm$ 0.14	2.77 $\pm$ 0.18	3.55 $\pm$ 0.2
	90	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	2.53 $\pm$ 0.21	2.37 $\pm$ 0.36	2.95 $\pm$ 0.3
	90	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	2.53 $\pm$ 0.21	2.37 $\pm$ 0.36	2.95 $\pm$ 0.3
8	30	2.18 $\pm$ 0.25	3.10 $\pm$ 0.10	3.26 $\pm$ 0.06	3.72 $\pm$ 0.0
	60	1.65 $\pm$ 0.15	2.51 $\pm$ 0.23	2.48 $\pm$ 0.44	3.43 $\pm$ 0.2
	90	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	2.09 $\pm$ 0.30	2.07 $\pm$ 0.26	2.57 $\pm$ 0.4
	90	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	2.09 $\pm$ 0.30	2.07 $\pm$ 0.26	2.57 $\pm$ 0.4
15	30	1.88 $\pm$ 0.30	2.87 $\pm$ 0.04	3.23 $\pm$ 0.12	3.42 $\pm$ 0.0
	60	1.67 $\pm$ 0.17	1.97 $\pm$ 0.30	2.23 $\pm$ 0.39	2.38 $\pm$ 0.0
	90	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.80 $\pm$ 0.29	1.57 $\pm$ 0.0
	90	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.80 $\pm$ 0.29	1.57 $\pm$ 0.0
21	30	1.67 $\pm$ 0.17	1.77 $\pm$ 0.17	2.59 $\pm$ 0.62	2.83 $\pm$ 0.2
	60	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.57 $\pm$ 0.0
	90	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.57 $\pm$ 0.0
	90	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.57 $\pm$ 0.0
25	30	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.67 $\pm$ 0.17	1.88 $\pm$ 0.0
	60	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.65 $\pm$ 0.1
	90	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.57 $\pm$ 0.0
	90	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.57 $\pm$ 0.00	1.57 $\pm$ 0.0